Creating Effective Rubrics
TESL PHE 2017

Susan Webb
Coordinator,
Language Curriculum Training Services

(with contributions by Christine Gascho)
Agenda

- Ice Breaker and Objectives
- PBLA / Assessments
- Elements
- Definitions
- Purposes / Beneficiaries
- Holistic / Analytic Aspects
- Steps in the Creation of Rubrics
- Building a Rubric Using Criteria from the Revised CLB
- Sources
- Q & A
Ice Breaker

How many people do you see in the optical illusion below?

a. Two
b. Four
c. More than four
d. Six
Objectives

- Review PBLA requirements / assessment types / skill areas / competencies
- Define what rubrics are
- Explain why rubrics are useful
- Outline tools and criteria
- Demonstrate development of simple rubrics
- Show how the Revised CLB can help
- Share sources referencing the CLB
Rubrics and PBLA

- Formative / summative assessments
- Ongoing assessment
- CLB level of completion: 70% to 100%
Formative vs. Summative Assessment

Assessment for learning (i.e., to enhance learning)
- Helps learners identify where they are; what they need to do next
- Main purpose: provide feedback that will promote learning

Assessment of learning (i.e., to determine what has been learned)

Focus on Formative Assessment…

- For PBLA: more emphasis on formative than summative
- Assessment: largely ongoing for learning
- No formal terms / semesters in LINC ∴ no “exit tests”
Key Elements to Include in a Rubric?

I’ll take the first three ideas…
One Skill:

- Speaking
- Listening
- Reading
- Writing

One Competency Area:

- Interacting with Others
- Getting Things Done
- Giving Instructions
- Sharing / Reproducing Information
- Comprehending Instructions / Information
Competencies and Rubrics...Hand in Hand

- Include all four competencies at top of each rubric
- Give each competency a checkbox:
  - Interacting with Others
  - Reproducing Information
  - Getting Things Done
  - Sharing Information

- Provides clarity to you / learner
- Helps learners complete inventory pages in My Portfolio (Language Companion)
What is a Rubric?

I’ll take the first three ideas…
Definitions

• Scoring tool: specific expectations
• Fixed scale: specific performance characteristics
• Rating scale: set of categories
• Scale: assessment tool
Why Use Rubrics (and Checklists?)

Provider:
- Measurable, objective approach
- Specific criteria

Used for:
- Assessing performances
- Indicating learning outcomes

Important because:
- Clarify “should have” qualities
- Provide structure
- Describe performance
Useful for Instructors Because...

- Straightforward method
- Focus your teaching
- Break down task into specific parts
- Provide concrete evidence for learners
- Reduce evaluation time
- Used for formative / summative assessments
- Score learners’ portfolio artefacts
- Help determine exit CLBs
Useful for Learners Because...

- Promote learner-centred approach
- Get learners thinking about “superior” language performance
- Provide definitive criteria
- Focus learning
- Encourage self and peer assessment
- Collaborate with instructor
- Pay closer attention to language task
Involving Learners - Hands-On

* works best with CLB 2 or higher

1. Learners work in teams - one skill area / task / rubric per team.
2. Teams create simple rubrics based on recent topics.
3. Teams perform other teams’ tasks / score each other.
4. Teams regroup and revise / refine their rubrics, based on classmates’ feedback.
5. Post revised rubrics on classroom wall / share in online repository.
Among the Benefits:

✓ Gain greater awareness of fine points/“check” items of scoring task
✓ Better able to analyze their own as well as peers’ performance of task
Collaboration – Instructors and Learners

Both instructors and learners can participate in creating rubrics...

...and benefit from collaborating!
Four Types of Assessment Tools

### Anecdotal comments
*Informal written notes*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assessment Tool</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Advantages, Disadvantages and Considerations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Anecdotal Comments| Informal written notes on learner products or processes. | *can provide individualized feedback focusing on what the learner needs to do to improve*  
*can provide feedback on aspects that are not included in the assessment criteria but are important to the learner* |

### Scale
*Marking on a continuum*

| Scale             | Marking on a continuum. Two ends points are assigned a meaning and performance is rated in relation to the two extremes. 
*e.g. 1 = never; 4 = always* | *relatively easy to construct and use but must be clear what each point on the scale means*  
*the CLB 2000 document suggests a four-point rating scale* |

### Rubric
*Fixed scale*

| Rubric            | A fixed scale with a list of characteristics that describe each score for a particular outcome. | *difficult and time-consuming to construct in advance – requires learner samples to construct the descriptors*  
*developing the rubric helps to clarify what each point on the scale means* |

### Checklist
*List to identify characteristics*

| Checklist         | A list to identify characteristics or behaviours that are present or not present. Scored as yes/no ratings. | *easy to use but doesn’t distinguish the quality of the performance*  
*useful for self-assessment*  
*useful for tasks such as completing forms, copying information* |
Analytic Aspects of Rubrics

...for evaluating productive skills (speaking / writing):
< More specific / relate to quality of performance >

- **Performance levels:** horizontal
- **Criteria:** vertical
- **Cells in centre:** blank / descriptions of specified criteria

### Breakfast in Bed: Analytic Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Levels</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Beginning</strong> 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Food</strong></td>
<td>Most food is colder or warmer than it should be, is under- or over-seasoned, or is under- or overcooked.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Presentation</strong></td>
<td>More than one item (tray, napkin, or silverware) are dirty or missing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comfort</strong></td>
<td>Wake-up is abrupt, little to no help with seating, and the recipient is rushed and crowded during the meal.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Holistic Aspects of Rubrics

*Single scale with all criteria…*

< Refer to overall / global communicative effectiveness >

- Single score (1 to 4, or 1 to 6 point scale) assigned, based on overall judgment of work
- Matches entire piece of work to single description on scale

**Breakfast in Bed: Holistic Rubric**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>All food is perfectly cooked, presentation surpasses expectations, and recipient is kept exceptionally comfortable throughout the meal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Food is cooked correctly, the meal is presented in a clean and well-organized manner, and the recipient is kept comfortable throughout the meal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Some food is cooked poorly, some aspects of presentation are sloppy or unclean, or the recipient is uncomfortable at times.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Most of the food is cooked poorly, the presentation is sloppy or unclean, and the recipient is uncomfortable most of the time.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Using Holistic / Analytic Criteria

Contains both types:

**Holistic** – looks at **big picture**: “Task performed effectively”

**Analytic** – looks at **details**:
- Verb tense use
- Vocabulary
- Eye contact/body language
- Vocal qualities
- Structure
Let’s brainstorm – I’ll take the first three language tasks
Sources of Language Tasks

For now...
Comprehensive collection of sample, real-world tasks (CCLB, 2002)

Down the road...

Real World Task (RWT) Bank to support PBLA – Ottawa-Carleton District School Board; expected publication timeframe: 2018
BM 1, Reading:

- Read and check the total on a receipt, bill or invoice
1. Decide on task: “Read and check the total on a receipt, bill or invoice (BM1)”

2. Check revised CLB for similar sample task: “Identify prices, sub-totals, taxes and total on a sales receipt”

3. Check competency area: “Getting Things Done”

4. Make list of necessary criteria: “Identifies numbers (amounts, dates); Finds total amount and date on receipts”

---

**Sample Tasks**
- Identify where to write personal information in the name and address section of a very simple application form for an English class.
- Identify prices, sub-totals, taxes and total on a sales receipt.

---

**III. Getting Things Done**
- Get information from very short, simple, common formatted texts (such as simple sections of forms, maps, diagrams, sales receipts, or common universal traffic signs and civic symbols).
  - Identifies numbers (amounts, dates) and familiar words (names, addresses, city names).
  - Finds total amount and date on receipts.

5. Set up checklist with criteria / points...
Sample Rubric Using a Task for CLB 1

Language Task: Read and check the total on a receipt, bill or invoice

SAMPLE RUBRIC FOR CLB 1 READING TASK

**TOPIC:** Shopping

**CLB 1 READING ASSESSMENT TASK:** read authentic hard copy sales receipt for information such as date, prices, sub-totals, taxes and total, and write the items

**Competency:**

- [ ] Interacting with Others
- [ ] Comprehending Instructions
- [x] Getting Things Done
- [ ] Comprehending Information

**Criteria:** Identify numbers (amounts, dates) and familiar words (receipt vocabulary – date/month/year, prices, sub-totals, taxes/HST and total), find total amount and date on receipt – in this case, the date, second price, sub-total, taxes and total.

**CLB:** CLB 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item number</th>
<th>Item:</th>
<th>Completed (✓)</th>
<th>Needs work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Circle the date (1 point)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Put an X beside the second price (1 point)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Put a star beside the sub-total (1 point)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Put a check mark beside the taxes/HST (1 point)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Underline the total amount (1 point)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SUCCESS = CLB 1:** 4/5 points (achieved 80% of the task/items)
BM 7, Writing:

- Write a memo to employees about a guest speaker presentation on safety in the workplace
Sample Rubric Using a Task for CLB 7

Language Task: Write a memo to employees about a guest speaker presentation on safety in the workplace

**SAMPLE RUBRIC FOR CLB 7 WRITING TASK**

**TOPIC:** Business Writing

**CLB 7 WRITING ASSESSMENT TASK:** Write a memo to employees about a guest speaker presentation on safety in the workplace

**Competency:**

- [ ] Interacting with Others
- [ ] Reproducing Information
- [x] Getting Things Done
- [ ] Sharing Information

**Criteria:** Convey a clear message; convey a sense of audience in language and format

**CLB:** CLB 7

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item number</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Points achieved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Includes title “Memo” and sections “To”, “From”, “Date”, and “Subject” or “Re” (1 point)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Purpose of writing clearly stated in first paragraph (2 points)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Details clearly presented in second paragraph (2 points)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Expected result or action clearly stated in third paragraph (2 points)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Appropriate level of formality used (3 points)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Good range of vocabulary for moderately complex texts (3 points)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Good control of spelling and punctuation (3 points)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SUCCESS = CLB 7:** 12/16 points (achieved 75% of the task/items)
Assessment Rubrics for Multi-Level Classes

For classes with more than one level:

- Use same task
- Adjust content slightly:
  - more demanding - higher level
  - less demanding - lower level

Great source of ideas for multi-level rubrics:

- Agnes Kucharska, PBLA Lead Teacher Immigrants Working Centre (Hamilton)

TESL PHE Spring 2017 Conference, *PBLA: Multilevel Productive Assessments CLB 1-4*
**Listening/Speaking Rubric for a CLB 3-4 Class**

**TOPIC:** At the Walk-in Clinic

**CLB 3-4: LISTENING AND SPEAKING TASK:** Role play making a request for assistance and listening and responding to questions from intake personnel at a walk in clinic.

**SPEAKING COMPETENCIES:** Interacting with Others/Sharing Information

**LISTENING COMPETENCIES:** Interacting With Others /Sharing Information (Listening Criteria: understands requests, questions and responds with appropriate information and actions; acknowledges greeting/closings, understands key vocabulary)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name:</th>
<th>Date:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>CLB: CLB 3 (QUESTIONS 1-6) or CLB 4 (QUESTIONS 1-8)</strong></th>
<th><strong>CLB: CLB 3 or CLB 4</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1</strong> Hello. How are you today?</td>
<td>Part A: Overall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2</strong> Have you been here before?</td>
<td>I can understand your information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3</strong> Can I see your Alberta Health Card, please?</td>
<td>Part B: Analytic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4</strong> What is your address?</td>
<td>Responds to greeting and closing politely</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5</strong> How can I help you?</td>
<td>*Gives basic information about self # 2-4, 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6</strong> <em>Tell me about your problem including the symptoms and how long you have had the problem. OR</em> Please describe the symptoms you have and how long you have felt this way</td>
<td>*States and describes problem # 5-7 CLB 3- uses some short simple sentences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>7</strong> <em>Clarifying question 1 from list.</em></td>
<td>CLB 4- uses several connected sentences to describe problem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8</strong> <em>What prescription/other medications are you taking? Who is your family Doctor?</em></td>
<td><em>Uses key vocabulary CLB 3:</em> tries to use some vocabulary. CLB 4: adequate use of vocabulary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thank you. Please wait a doctor will be with you shortly. Bye</td>
<td>*CLB 4: Fluency is adequate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Success:** CLB 3 = 5 out of 6 questions; must include *items CLB 4 = 6 out of 8; 2 of *items

**YOU DID WELL:**

**NEXT TIME:**

Centre for Education & Training - Language Curriculum Training Services 2017-2018
Task: Listen to a classmate give simple personal details, such as spelling his/her name, and giving a phone number and email address.

Skill area: Listening
Competency: Comprehending Information
Specific criteria you could include:

- **Numbers**: sample classmate’s telephone number
- **Letters**: the ones for spelling a classmate’s name (plus spelling alphabet)
- **Key words and expressions**: first name, last/family/surname, area code, telephone number, email address, including “at” and “dot” symbols
- **Words related to personal identification information**: name, telephone number, email address
Sources of Rubrics for Language Training Assessment

Good sources, both theoretical and practical:

1. Language Instruction Support and Training Network (LISTN), *Classroom Assessment Toolkit: Literacy to CLB 8* (Revised 2015), Revisions by Aaron Kilner, Svetlana Lupasco, Kathryn Rockwell and Shawna Williams


5. Centre for Canadian Language Benchmarks, *Canadian Language Benchmarks 5-10 Exit Assessment Tasks*, 2007, multiple contributors
LISTN Classroom Assessment Toolkit
(CLB 1-8: all skills / many competency areas; some R and W literacy)

From home page (https://listn.tutela.ca/):
Classroom Assessment Toolkit
⇒ Reading Tools

Comprehending Instructions tool for CLB 6...

Reading Tools

= Print-ready PDF of the assessment task and tool, sample template, blank template, and classroom worksheets

= Editable Word file of template only

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CLB</th>
<th>Interacting with Others</th>
<th>Comprehending Instructions</th>
<th>Getting Things Done</th>
<th>Comprehending Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
II. Comprehending Instructions

- Understand moderately complex instructions and instructional texts for multistep procedures related to everyday situations, where the sequence must be inferred.

Task: Read and follow instructions for at-home health equipment.

Tool: Anecdotal Comments - labels

Date: January 4th, 2014  Name: Amir
LINC 6/ CLB 6-II

Feedback to Student: Did you find the diagrams helped you understand the instructions? You seemed to have trouble with the humidifier. Were the instructions difficult to understand?
We’ve Covered...

- PBLA / Assessments
- Definitions
- Reasons
- Purposes / Beneficiaries
- Holistic / Analytic Aspects
- Steps and Samples
- Rubric-building using Criteria from the CLB
- Sources

Questions? Let’s Chat Outside! 😊
References

- Centre for Canadian Language Benchmarks, *Canadian Language Benchmarks: English as a Second Language for Adults* (2012), Anne Hajer, Anne-Marie Kaskens et al
- DePaul University Teaching Commons, *Types of Rubrics* (http://resources.depaul.edu/teaching-commons/teaching-guides/feedback-grading/rubrics/pages/types-of-rubrics.aspx)
- Language Instruction Support and Training Network (LISTN), *Classroom Assessment Toolkit: Literacy to CLB 8* (Revised 2015), Revisions by Aaron Kilner, Svetlana Lupasco, Kathryn Rockwell and Shawna Williams
THANK YOU

Susan Webb
swebb@tcet.com